Resilience Development Initiative

In dialogue with the Grassroots: Advocating for the Role of Women in Countering and Preventing Violent Extremism in Indonesia

Katrina Scaramella

The Australian National University

Dr. Nino Viartasiwi

Resilience Development Initiative

`

WP No : 3
Date : 2018

Resilience Development Initiative

Resilience Development Initiative (RDI) is a global think tank initiative based in Bandung, Indonesia that focuses on environmental change and sustainable development. RDI contributes to the body of knowledge on development and disaster research studies in Indonesia and South East Asian Region.

RDI Working Paper Series is published electronically by RDI.

The views expressed in each working paper are those of the author or authors of the paper. They do not necessarily represent the views of RDI or its editorial committee.

Citation of this electronic publication should be made in Harvard System of Referencing.

Contact:

Address: Jalan Imperial II No. 52, Bandung 40135
Jawa Barat – INDONESIA
Phone: +62 22 2536574
Email: rdi@rdi.or.id
Website: www.rdi.or.id

`

In dialogue with the Grassroots: Advocating for the Role of Women in Countering and Preventing Violent Extremism in Indonesia

Katrina Scaramella,[1] Dr. Nino Viartasiwi[2]

[1] *The Australian National University, Australia*

[2] *Resilience Development Initiative, Indonesia*

Abstract

The Surabaya Bombings in 2018 became a watershed moment in Indonesia, highlighting the pertinence of gender in analysing and countering terrorism (CT). This not only raised awareness of the nature of the homegrown radicalisation and motivation of women, using their own agency, to commit violence. However, such events brought to the forefront of Indonesian CT, the role that women can play as agents of change in preventing the rise of extremism in their communities and the organisations that are pioneering this work. Overall, this paper is interested in outlining and dissecting Indonesia's attempts to include women in P/CVE efforts in counter-terrorism. This paper argues that Indonesia serves as a pioneer in using the Women, Peace and Security agenda to make real change to CT. This paper draws its findings and recommendations from two main research methods: a literature review and one on one semi structured interviews with female-led Indonesian grassroots organisations in the P/CVE space. Indonesia has served as an outstanding example of how a vibrant and engaged grassroots can shift CT approaches towards a whole of society approach with the inclusion of women's perspectives at its core. However, the Indonesian example serves as a stark reminder that where women's perspectives are crucial in contributing to more effective CT policy, there are still obstacles in bringing gender to the forefront of how-to CT

Keywords:

Counterterrorism, Violent Extremism, Gender Empowerment, Indonesia.

1. Introduction

The Surabaya Bombings in 2018[3] became a watershed moment in Indonesia, highlighting the pertinence of gender in analyzing and countering terrorism (CT). This raised awareness of the nature of the homegrown radicalisation and motivation of women, using their own agency, to commit violence.[4] These events brought to the forefront of Indonesian CT, the role that women can play as agents of change in preventing the rise of extremism in their communities and the organisations that are pioneering this work. Since Security Council Resolution 1325, the Women, Peace and Security (WPS) Agenda has slowly begun to champion the importance of involving women's perspectives into preventing and countering violent

[1] Corresponding Author: katrinascaramella@gmail.com

[2] Corresponding Author: viartasiwi@gmail.com

[3] On 13 and 14 May 2018, three families of jihadists blew themselves up in several churches and police headquarter in Surabaya, East Java Province. Suicide bombings have become a tactics used by Indonesian homegrown terrorists. What new in Surabaya bombings were the active involvement of the wives and children as the active bombers.

[4] IPAC (2017) argues that since the end of 2015 women involvement in violent extremism has been more active after a French woman named Hasna Aitboulahcen was titled as "Europe's first female suicide bomber". Particularly on activism, the surge of involvement was started in the early 2000s due to the safe and open space provided by social media platforms, such as done by Aisyah Lina Kamelya, Nurul Azmi Tibyani and Syahadah. As for actual active role in violent extremism, on December 2016, Indah Dian Yulia Novi, Arida Putri Maharani and Ika Puspitasari were arrested after pledging to become suicide bombers. Their facilitator, Tutin Sugiarti, was also arrested. On July 2017, Tini Susanti Kaduku alias Umi Fadil and Nurmi Usman were sentenced for three years in jail for their roles as armed combatants of the Mujahidin of Eastern Indonesia (Mujahidin Indonesia Timur, MIT).

`

extremism (P/CVE) on a global level. Indonesia has served as an outstanding example of how a vibrant and engaged grassroots can shift CT approaches towards a whole of society approach with the inclusion of women's perspectives at its core.

Indonesian has served as an outstanding example of how vibrant and engaged grassroots movements can shift CT approaches to a whole of society approach with the inclusion of women at its core. However, the Indonesian example also serves as a stark reminder that there are still obstacles in bringing gender to the forefront of how to CT. It is clear that the current state of understanding and involving women's contributions in P/CVE efforts is simplified and does not take into account the broad range of roles women can play and the contributions they can make. Whilst organisations who champion the role of women in P/CVE are increasingly involved in implementation in prevention efforts in Indonesia, there are still important systemic changes that need to be made to achieve effective gender mainstreaming in CT policy making and law enforcement in Indonesia.

This paper argues that Indonesia serves as a pioneer in using the Women, Peace and Security agenda to make real change to CT. The work that is being done to advocate and pioneer the role of women in P/CVE has been inspiring to say the least. It has reflected the possibility of how CT can move beyond a security centered approach and become more effective by investing in a whole of society approach. Indonesian grassroots activities have also aimed to work through and identify the complexity of the relationship between religion and gender norms, finding solutions to perennial social tensions and using P/CVE to promote gender equality and women's empowerment. This study has also revealed several frameworks and mechanisms developed by grassroots actors that could serve as international best practice models for including women's perspectives and gender considerations in CT.

The study firstly examines the current frameworks of WPS to reason that involving women in peace processes makes significant differences in conflict prevention, resolution, and peacebuilding. Secondly, the study refers and presents the current standing literature on women's contribution to P/CVE and the nature of the organisations that push for such change on the grassroots. Thirdly, the study unpacks the first hand experiences and expertise of Indonesian, female-led grassroots organisations in the P/CVE space.

2. Methodology

This paper draws its findings and recommendations from two main research methods. Firstly, we have conducted a literature review, analyzing key pieces of literature in this field to provide a balanced yet informative picture of what academia is currently suggesting. The literature review aims to set the foundation for the paper and draws out the main considerations relating to the different roles and ways women can be engaged in P/CVE and a profile of grassroots organisations that are a bridge between civil society and high-level decision-making in CT. The latter half of the review focuses on organisations in Indonesia- describing the nature of these organisations as global best practice models.

Secondly, to unpack concepts discussed in the literature review and put them into practice, we have conducted two, semi-structured one-on-one interviews with high level representatives from two prominent grassroots organisations in Indonesia. These organisations and participants are: Ruby Kholifa from the Asian Muslim Action Network (AMAN) and Visna Voluvik from the Wahid Foundation/ Institute. Whilst these interviews

`

do not represent the broader experiences of the numerous and diverse female led grassroots based organisations in Indonesia, these organisations and individuals are key stakeholders in the Indonesia's whole of society approach to CT and have a widespread grassroots presence across Indonesia. The findings from these interviews serve as an important foundation for discussion on the nature of women in P/CVE. It is important to note that answers from participants were bias in that they produced subjective and emotional responses about their role and their organization's role in the CT space in Indonesia. Ultimately, this was hard to avoid due to the nature of the questions asked of participants, especially when asked to describe the functions and impacts of their organisations and programs. This paper has attempted to objectively analyses and compare the thoughts, experiences and perspectives of both participants.

Conceptual Foundation

Women, Peace and Security (WPS)

The inclusion of women and gender issues to peace and security issues was firstly cemented through the UN Security Council Resolution (SCR) 1325 in 2000 on Women, Peace and Security. Seven other resolutions have followed since. The UNSCR acknowledged violence towards women in armed conflict as a threat to international peace and security. By putting gender-based violence in the international peace and security framework, the resolution advocates for women's right to participate equally with men in conflict prevention, peace negotiations, and peacebuilding initiatives.

As a global agenda, WPS concept is built on the tenet that women and girls are the parties who suffer the most on armed conflict, due to the organized sexual and gender-based violence, but are often neglected in conflict prevention, resolution and peacebuilding. Four pillars of the WPS agenda are participation, protection, prevention, relief and recovery. The initiative to involve women in peace and security works is to uphold and protect women's human rights; to encourage their participation and recognition in the critical work surrounding conflict prevention, resolution and peacebuilding; and to ensure peace is sustainable.[5]

Even though the technical implementation of WPS varies from country to country, women are encouraged to be involved in all three tracks of peace processes. Track one is official negotiations by leaders of conflicting parties to find a compromise on political and economic, or military aspects. Track two accommodates civil society organisations (CSO's) to contribute to the peace process. Even though actors in track two are not directly involved in track one peace negotiations, they are politically influential as they provide review and support to policy and to government's security frameworks. The track three process is conducted by individual actors on grassroots levels to tackle the daily struggles of people inside the conflict zones. Usually, women are active in track two and three of peace processes, WPS framework invites women to be actively engaged in peace negotiations. Women's involvement in track one peace process will ensure that their voices and needs on peacebuilding are accommodated and guarantee that conflict-related sexual and gender-based violence during the conflict are appropriately addressed.

[5] Australian National Committee for UN Women, 2014. Women, Peace & Security: an introductory manual, s.l.: Australian National Committee for UN Women.

`

Preventing and Countering Violent Extremism (P/CVE)

As a field of study, P/CVE is new terrain. The attention to P/CVE and radicalisation developed after the terrorist attacks on 11 September 2001, the "home-grown" and "lone wolf" terrorists in Europe, and the international concern with foreign fighters traveling to Iraq and Syria.[6] Since then, CT has become a national security concern that has influenced government policies around the world. One reason to make CT as a specific subject within national security is that traditional security approaches and policies are deemed insufficient to fight extremism. Traditional security approaches and policies are not equipped with a mechanism to understand the underlying factors that influence radicalisation on individuals and communities. Therefore, a different approach from hard security policies is the P/CVE framework which is built to prevent individuals or communities from being drawn to violent extremism in the first place and build resilience within individuals and communities against violent extremism.

P/CVE is an important pillar in the global collective efforts to deal with terrorism. P/CVE took global attention in 2016 after UN General Secretary Ban Ki-Moon announced, "Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism." The United Nations General Assembly then adopted resolution A/RES/70/29 on "The United Nations Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy Review" on 1 July 2016.[7] The resolution shows a global consensus for a stronger commitment to combat terrorism and violent extremism. On 15 June 2017, the UN established the United Nations Office of Counter-Terrorism that is also a momentum of a more strategic action of global counter-terrorism efforts. The Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy comprises of four pillars. First, addressing the conditions conducive to the spread of terrorism. Second, measures to prevent and combat terrorism. Third, measures to build states' capacity to prevent and combat terrorism and to strengthen the role of the United Nations system in that regard. Fourth, measures to ensure respect for human rights for all and the rule of law as the fundamental basis for the fight against terrorism.[8] The four pillars recognize the role of the state as the main actor in P/CVE in the corridor of UN core values on human rights and the rule of law.

On the national level, P/CVE policies differ across countries. Hardy argues that different national policy on CVE is also founded on the differences in defining radicalisation as the base of CVE policy.[9] As a consequence, there are differences in each country in understanding the causes of radicalisation and the most critical factors behind radicalisation. Further, having a consistent or compatible explanation of the radicalization concept for generalization on a global level becomes a challenge. National P/CVE policy is also contextualized within the cultural and political challenges of the country. With the understanding that different policy may lead to a different action in the field with different main actors taking the task of the fight against violent extremism. In the same vein,

[6] Barnes, J., 2017. Countering violent extremism: contemporary research and its challenges. In: L. E. Sayed & J. Barnes, eds. Contemporary P/CVE Research and Practice. s.l.:Hedayah and Edith Cowan University, pp. 7-18.

[7] United Nations Office of Counter-Terrorism, 2019. Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism. [Online]
Available at: https://www.un.org/counterterrorism/ctitf/en/plan-action-prevent-violent-extremism [Accessed 8 September 2019]

[8] United Nations Office of Counter-Terrorism, 2019. Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism. [Online]
Available at: https://www.un.org/counterterrorism/ctitf/en/plan-action-prevent-violent-extremism
[Accessed 8 September 2019]

[9] Hardy, Keiran, 2018. Comparing Theories of Radicalisation with Countering Violent Extremism Policy. Journal for Deradicalization, Issue 15, pp. 76-100

`

synchronizing global P/CVE policy with national P/CVE action may potentially face dynamic obstacles.

On national and local levels, P/CVE initiatives are driven by collaboration between civil society as local-experts and the government apparatus. On a local level, a country such as Indonesia experiences P/CVE initiatives led by civil society organisations (CSOs) and other local actors. The activation of local networks and contextualized P/CVE platforms offered by those actors caters of different segments P/CVE and, at the same time, expands the community of P/CVE stakeholders. However, certain limitations can be expected from the involvement of CSOs and local actors within P/CVE such as the gap between local programs and national or global implementation of P/CVE strategies due to the contextual content of the program at the local level. In turn, this creates difficulties such as gaps in knowledge between effective programs and ineffective programs. How to link different levels of P/CVE efforts with different actors and stakeholders remains open for further exploration.

Women in Preventing and Countering Violent Extremism

Women's involvement in P/CVE initiatives is based on the experience of women's involvement in conflict prevention and peacebuilding in the WPS concept. In its initial stage in the early 2000s, men and boys were the key targets of P/CVE efforts while the roles of women and girls were generally marginalized. As women and girls are also being seen as victims of terrorism and targets of radicalisation, the inclusive P/CVE policy should also be framed in a gender perspective. The alignment of the WPS agenda with P/CVE aims to sustain women's participation in P/CVE. It will be done through empowering women and inviting women-led organisations to consultation, decision-making and implementation tables. Moreover, a gender perspective on P/CVE will ensure a more holistic approach to a P/CVE program. In practice, women's perspectives in P/CVE are examined, and women's needs and priorities on the issue are identified, as well as their potential to promote non-violent values and peacebuilding efforts.

The official alignment of WPS to P/CVE program was done in 2015, through UNSCR 2242 that endorses higher engagement and leadership of women within the CT and violent extremism prevention agenda. Further, in its biennial review, in June 2018, the General Assembly released the Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy that highlights the critical role of women in P/CVE. The Global Counter-Terrorism strategy also urges for the integration of gender analyses on the programs that deal with the drivers of radicalisation.

Despite the seemingly positive initiatives to empower and advocate women's involvement in CT projects, some critics question the underlying assumptions of the effort. Winterbotham argues that women's agency in P/CVE efforts stems from the myth that women are more peaceful than men, and that mothers are able to detect radicalism, is a myth that potentially harms CVE efforts rather than helping it.[10] Winterbotham suggests that this 'myth' neglects women's participation in violent groups as active actors. Moreover, Winterbotham questions the assumption that gender equality reduces violent extremism because rather than empowering women, the effort may invite resistance from women with a particular cultural background as imposing western values and secularization. Similarly, OSCE argues that the mainstream understanding of men as violent actors, while women are victims, leads to a

[10] Winterbotham, Emily, 2018. Do Mothers Know Best? How Assumptions Harm CVE, London: Tony Blair Institute of Global Change.

`

gender-blind policy, reducing the effectiveness of P/CVE efforts.[11] Looking beyond these criticisms, a gender inclusive P/CVE effort calls for understanding the gender dynamics related to radicalisation and violent extremism and provides gender-sensitive prevention mechanisms.

The next step of aligning WPS with P/CVE agenda is by framing it into a local context which this paper aims to do through the case study of Indonesia. In the context of women's participation in the P/CVE agenda in Indonesia, this study will dissect how CSOs work on the ground in local context.

3. Literature Review

Couture argues that "when women are empowered socially, politically and economically in culturally appropriate and relevant ways, they will become contributing members of society who hold the answers and solutions to complex issues… inherent in CVE."[12] It is the types of roles that women play in P/CVE and the means to achieve and advocate for this relevance that drive debate in the literature. Overall, the literature suggests that the inclusion of gendered experiences in P/CVE approaches are still a work in progress. Currently, operational and academic CT fields acknowledge women's contributions to P/CVE through a narrow lens of how their roles as mothers can be leveraged to de radicalise in families and communities. However, the WPS/P/CVE literature presents a myriad of ways women can counter extremism.

Women's role in CVE

The literature uncovers that there is a widespread lack of understanding of the way's women experience terrorism. As Eddyono & Davis reiterate, women are not only victims of violence, but they can be both perpetrators and agents of change in promoting peace.[13] Where there are a range of ways women can experience terrorism, there are equally diverse ways women can be mobilized to counter it. Without such considerations becoming mainstream, counter-terrorism approaches can be considered somewhat incomplete. To begin to complete this picture, we can break women's contributions to P/CVE into two main roles: through their traditional roles at the nucleus of the family and through less-traditional roles as leaders in the community.

Traditional roles

The inclusion of women in P/CVE has overwhelmingly focused on the unique position of being a mother, wife, daughter, sister and caretaker in reversing the process of deradicaliation or promoting peace. The Quilliam Foundation suggests that, women in their traditional roles as mothers and wives serve as an untapped resource and can be "emotion leaders, platforms for stability, support and compassion as well as a social authority for husbands and

[11] Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, 2019. Understanding the Role of Gender in Preventing and Countering Violent Extremism and Radicalization That Lead to Terrorism: Good Practices for Law Enforcement. Vienna: the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe.

[12] Couture, K., 2014. A Gendered Approach to Countering Violent Extremism: Lessons Learned From Women In Peacebuilding and Conflict Prevention Applied Successfully In Bangladesh and Morocco. Brookings Institute, pp. 2. Available at: https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/Women-CVE-Formatted-72914-Couture-FINAL2.pdf.

[13] Davies, Sarah E., Eddyono, S., 2019. Women's Roles in CVE. In. 1st ed.: Oxford University Press.

`

children...prone to extremism."[14] Whilst Quilliam highlights that the function of the mother in the family is highly subjective and not globally uniform, Quilliam also suggests that children will more likely look to their mothers as authority figures and thus hold the power to promote peaceful narratives that could shift deradicalisation.[15] Similarly, Couture suggests that women's traditional roles serve as an important contribution to the P/CVE space because: "women tend to invest more back into their families than men, and when they have more to invest in terms of an education, money or health, their families will feel the benefits of this empowerment."[16]

Some in the literature view traditional roles of women as important towards detecting a path of radicalisation. For example, Schlaffer notes the importance of mothers in early detection of behavior change, sensing when their children or husbands are frustrated, angry or resentful.[17] However, others such as Eddyono & Davis move to challenge this argument slightly by suggesting that women's roles in family nucleuses are complex and thus, the utility of women in P/CVE is dependent upon the role a woman holds within the family.[18] For example, Eddyono and Davis suggest that mothers are in an influential position to promote or demote the concept of 'jihad' to their sons in comparison to wives who could influence their husbands to not return to jail due to violent extremist behavior.[19]

Feminist critiques highlight how women's roles in P/CVE have simplified and instrumentalised the role of 'mothers' and other female caretaker roles. As argued by Ni Aolain, women's role in P/CVE has been simplified to mothers as strategic assets for authorities in their law enforcement activities.[20] d'Estaing highlights how current P/CVE policy uses women in their roles as mothers to access private spheres of those who are radicalised.[21] Additionally, it places a large burden on mothers by creating this good/bad mother dynamic. Mothers will be more likely to shoulder judgements such as good and poor parenting if they passed the test' in ensuring that their children do not adopt violent extremist views.[22] Such generalized approaches oversimplify the roles that mothers play across different family structures and dynamics and place the blame on mothers if they somehow fail in their attempts to deter violent extremism. Furthermore, it is argued that mothers who are already disadvantaged in their social and economic circumstances can face further alienation either by being out of step with community opinions on how P/CVE should be conducted.[23] This is especially true of 'mothers' who work directly with law enforcement whom many communities fear or distrust. Considering these criticisms, both d'Estaing and

---

[14] Majoran, A., 2015. Mothers & Wives: Women's Potential Role in Countering Violent Extremism. Quilliam Foundation. [Online] Available at: https://www.quilliaminternational.com/mothers-wives-womens-potential-role-in-countering-violent-extremism/.

[15] Ibid.

[16] Couture, K. A Gendered Approach, pp. 11.

[17] Centre for Gender and Peacebuilding, 2015. Charting a New Course: Thought for Action Kit. Women Preventing Violent Extremism. United States Institute of Peace, pp. 30. Available at: https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/files/Women-Preventing-Violent-Extremism-Charting-New-Course.pdf.

[18] Davies, Sarah E., Eddyono, S. Women's Role in CVE.

[19] Ibid.

[20] Aolian, F., 2015. Jihad, counter-terrorism and mothers. Just Security. Available at: https:// www.justsecurity.org/20407/jihad-counter-terrorism-mothers/.

[21] d'Estaing, S., 2017. Engaging women in countering violent extremism: avoiding instrumentalisation and furthering agency. Gender & Development, 25, no. 1. pp.103-118.

[22] Ibid.

[23] Aolian, F., Jihad, counter-terrorism and mothers.

`

Ni Aolain promote that policy should identify and value other contributions women can make to P/CVE beyond assetisation in traditional roles. The next subsection will explore these roles.

Lesser traditional roles

Lesser traditional roles recognize and advocate for women as active leaders, religious thinkers, activists, teachers, politicians and as networked individuals. Eddyono & Davis argue that approaches to P/CVE should help women recognize themselves as autonomous and relevant actors with agency.[24] This would mean that P/CVE approaches would start to recognize the relevance of gendered experiences beyond what law enforcement and policy views as a strategic asset in deradicalisation.

'Lesser traditional roles' is a term coined by Couture, encapsulating the types of 'activism' roles women can play in P/CVE.[25] Lesser traditional roles, especially in Indonesia, are focused on the religious empowerment of women such as the promotion of women in religious leadership positions or educating women on more tolerant versions of religion. Women's empowerment through education and the empowerment of their religious education sit at the core of this contribution. Additionally, True & Eddyono highlight how empowerment through religious discourses and the rise of female Ulama in Indonesian communities will strengthen female leadership and empowerment in communities.[26] Similarly, Taskarina argues that religious empowerment through gendered interpretations of religion and the installation of female religious leaders will empower women's agency towards identifying and countering radicalism.[27]

Additionally, the literature argues for the inclusion of women in law enforcement and policing to continue to bridge trust between state institutions and communities towards P/CVE. Brown argues that to build inclusive P/CVE policy requires a greater commitment to growing the female population of law enforcement officers and decision-makers.[28] This aims to include more representative voices of communities in state institutions, therefore bridging gaps of mistrust. d'Estaing makes a similar argument, highlighting how women in positions of leadership and in positions of policing authority will help avoid the simplification of the role that women can play in P/CVE.[29]

The bottom line is that women can contribute to P/CVE in varied and complex ways. To suggest that the extent of women's role in P/CVE is as mothers, wives, sisters, daughters and caretakers does a disservice to the myriad of ways women can be equal and thus empowered actors towards peace. However, it is important to consider that women in their more traditional roles still serve as an important aspect of an overall picture of female contributions to P/CVE and should not be completely discarded by feminist critiques. For example, if

---

[24] Davies, Sarah E., Eddyono, S. Women's role is CVE.

[25] Couture, K., A Gendered Approach.

[26] True J., Eddyono, S., 2017. Preventing Violent Extremism: Gender Perspectives and Women's Roles. Monash University. Available at: https://arts.monash.edu/__data/assets/pdf_file/0011/1779068/Policy-brief-PVE-2017.pdf.

[27] Taskarina, L., 2019. Perempuan Dan Terorisme: Kisah perempuan dalam Kejahatan Terorisme. Elex Media Komputindo.

[28] Brown, K., 2013. Gender and counter-radicalization, women and emerging counterterrorism measures. In: Margaret L. Satterthwaite and Jayne Huckerby eds. 2013. Gender, National Security and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives. Routledge. pp. 36–59.

[29] d'Estaing. Engaging women in countering violent extremism.

`

P/CVE approaches can empower gender equality and a more empowered female voice in society, mothers, wives, sisters, daughters and caretakers can have a long-lasting impact in the family home. It is also important to recognize that the role of women in the family and in communities varies across the world and it should not be assumed that all women have the capacity to contribute to P/CVE. This paper questions whether women (specifically Indonesian) who are unconsciously involved in terrorism or radical families due to the persistence of patriarchal norms, can contribute to P/CVE? These are local questions that this paper aims to unpack through the following sections of the literature review and subsequent fieldwork.

Goals, Types and Activities of female-led grassroots organisations to P/CVE

Female-led grassroots organisations have emerged to empower the various roles women play in P/CVE. This section will provide an overview of the nature, activities, motivations and obstacles of these organisations as documented in the literature. It will have a focus on Indonesian organisations that have an impact on a local Indonesian community.

Women's organisations conduct their activities with a commitment to prevention. The United Nations Security Council Resolution 2422, "promotes upstream prevention efforts and encourages… (Member states and United Nations institutions), to be committed to projects which address gender dimensions including women's empowerment."[30] Accordingly, organisations committed to P/CVE view gender equality and women's empowerment as key in preventing the ability for extremist content and ideas to grow. As highlighted by True and Eddyono, efforts to build a prevention focused movement can be found in the work that women's organisations conduct because they provide a unique, gendered perspective that can strengthen CT.[31] It is the extent to which governments are willing to recognize the importance of a gendered prevention focused approach that will determine the effectiveness of CT. Therefore, prevention becomes a key buzzword in defining the goals and motivations of women's organisations in the P/CVE space, providing key contributions to a whole society approach to P/CVE.

Underlying the prevention focused motivations of grassroots P/CVE community organisations are gender equality, women's empowerment and critical thinking. Therefore, we can assume that organisations in the P/CVE space believe promoting gendered experiences and equality is key to preventing radicalisation and the birth of extremism on a grassroots level. As argued by Couture, Davis & Eddyono and d'Estaing, there are correlations between gender equality and low levels of extremism. Gender equality stood as the main deterrent for peacebuilding and conflict prevention that also demonstrated positively for P/CVE efforts. Thus, it is fair to assume that gender inequality is a good indicator of possible extremist thought and action. As confirmed by True et.al, interviews across UN Women sites in Indonesia and Bangladesh revealed seven indicators that women believe to indicate a rise in extremism.[32] These indicators include:

- "Domestic violence and children not talking to their mothers;

[30] Security Council Resolution 2422 (2018).

[31] True J., Eddyono, S., Countering Violent Extremism.

[32] UN Women, 2017. Empowered Women, Peaceful Communities. United Nations. Available at: https://www2.unwomen.org/-/media/field%20office%20eseasia/docs/publications/2019/08/ap-pve-unw19290_brochure_002_web-compressed.pdf?la=en&vs=4035.

`

- Becoming aloof and/or separating themselves from their communities for periods of time;
- Violence during elections, including threats to steal property and animals;
- The connection between elections and the sudden uptick in the activity of vigilante groups and violence;
- Sudden acquisition of money and wealth, especially by youth;
- The exclusive use of mosques by people on university campuses;
- Husbands controlling women's behavior, particularly relating to clothing."[33]

With behavior towards women being a key indicator of rising extremism, challenging male power and enforcement of patriarchal norms has become the goal of grassroots organisations in their contributions to P/CVE. This is particularly of concern in the Indonesian context as argued by Taskarina.[34] A key aspect of understanding the gendered and complex nature of radicalisation is to understand how women are unconsciously participating in radical activities and thought because of patriarchal norms. Taskarina coins the phenomena of 'victimization' of wives in Indonesia, who lose all sense of self as their internalise their own identity to be that of their husbands.[35] Taskarina describes how gender imbalances become a dangerous entry point for female radicalisation, where women do not fully understand their own victimization.[36] As will be discussed in the next section, religious re-education has become the key goal of organisations to help women realize their own victimization.

Others have argued that methods to P/CVE must be understood within a broader framework of community empowerment to challenge radicalisation factors. The role of gendered economic empowerment, improvement of services and the rule of law are all important contributing factors, that also play a role in the work done by civil society in CVE. For example, Couture highlights how poverty in Bangladesh and Morocco was a key driver of extremism in societies.[37] Women's organisations in response promoted economic programs to provide women with work and their own income. Such programs identified how empowered economic opportunity for women would have flow on effects in terms of social and religious agency, thus working towards gender equality.

Established organisations in Indonesia include the Asian Muslim Action Network (AMAN), the Wahid Institute, The Indonesian Conference on Religion and Peace (ICRP), with international organisations Sisters Against Violent Extremism (SAVE) and UN Women that have established a presence. Additionally, nationwide Islamic organizations such as Muhammadyah and Nahdiatul Ulama Organisations act as a representation for Muslim women across the country, advocating for their rights and gender equality in religious interpretations. To reach local communities, autonomous organisations have been established to continue the work of these two peak organisations. Fatayat (wing organization of Nahdiatul Ulama), Aisiyah (wing organization of Muhammadyah), Muslimat and IPPNU bring together grassroots feminist activists to promote democracy and gender equality. Additionally, Wulan investigates the role of Indonesia's Family Welfare Organization-*Pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga* (PKK).[38] The organization exists on all levels of

[33] Ibid.

[34] Taskarina, L. Perempuan dan Terorisme.

[35] Ibid.

[36] Ibid.

[37] Couture, K., A Gendered Approach.

[38] Wulan, L., 2018. Enhancing the Role of Women in Indonesia to Counter Terrorism. Alumni Perpectives. pp. 1-13.

`

Indonesian society from the national to the provincial and aims to improve the welfare of families through promoting education, religion, information and independence. Wulan argues that the PKK aims to empower families with tolerance and opportunity that will have ramifications on women within the family structure.[39] Finally, Taskarina argues that grassroots organisations in general can contribute to P/CVE through gender equality initiatives, the promotion of well-being and advocating for women to be the head of education in the family structure.[40] As presented by the literature, there are a range of organisations working to empower women to P/CVE and promote gendered perspectives into CT in Indonesia.

Gender-based perspectives and the championing of women's agency in P/CVE needs implementation at policy and program making levels for a whole society approach to be an effective reality. However, the main obstacle in mainstreaming gendered experiences into policy outcomes is the lack of genuine, changemaking engagement and partnership with those involved in CT policy and programs. The literature points to 'less genuine' realities of involvement of women and women's organisations in P/CVE. d'Estaing highlights how mere consultation of civil society, specifically women's groups, is not inclusion in decision-making. Furthermore, Ni Aolain argues that whilst UNSC Resolution 2422 advocates for the inclusion of women's organisations at the decision-making level, states, even those with dedicated National Action Plans, have yet to genuinely implement women and women's organisations in planning and design for CT prevention.[41]

Furthermore, Taskarina describes a clear disconnect between organisations, community organisations and civil society with local and national governments.[42] Taskarina highlights how Indonesian government level P/CVE policy and thinking is gender neutral as it does not consider the gendered experiences that both men and women face in experiencing as well as countering VE.[43] Despite this, Taskarina highlights that many organisations working in P/CVE means that the capacity is there for closer working relations with government[44]. However, it is dependent on political will and commitment on behalf of governments at all levels to foster such a partnership. Overall, genuine inclusion of women's organisations and their grassroots knowledge in policy and program planning means the comprehensive development of the whole of society approach to CT.

Moving Forward

The literature review has demonstrated two main concerns that we attempt to address in our qualitative study. Firstly, it highlights the broad contributions that women can make to preventing and countering violent extremism, moving beyond instrumentalisation and towards empowerment and leadership. Secondly, that grassroots organisations play a crucial role in fostering women's capacity for contribution to CT and act as a bridge between the grassroots and policy advocacy and change.

[39] Ibid.

[40] Taskarina, L. Perempuan dan Terorisme.

[41] Aolian, F., Jihad, counter-terrorism and mothers.

[42] Taskarina, L. Perempuan dan Terorisme.

[43] Ibid.

[44] Ibid.

`

The following stages of this paper will present the experiences and findings of our qualitative study in response to the research concerns of this paper. In doing so, we can compare the insights of Indonesia's most prominent civil society actors in the P/CVE space with the findings of our literature review. A more detailed, nuanced picture is painted about the trajectory of Indonesia's whole of society approach to CT that champions the direct involvement of women's, grassroots based organisations.

4. Findings and Discussion

Overall, our qualitative study produced both a positive and hopeful picture of Indonesia's attempts to champion a whole society approach to CT. This section will discuss three pertinent findings from our interviews that either confirm or contribute to the ongoing literature on the implementation of women and gendered perspectives in P/CVE. The three main findings to be discussed include:

- Peacebuilding and building a whole society approach to CT, with a focus on women's empowerment and gender equality, is the main framework used for the design of activities and programs spearheaded by grassroots organisations;
- There is a complicated social history with radicalism, religion and gender norms that puts gender inequality at the heart of extremism in Indonesia. However, there is still a powerful sense of agency that exists amongst Indonesian women that means they can become key agents of change in P/CVE;
- Grassroots organisations in Indonesia have well established relationships with government ministries and the main counter-terrorism law enforcement agency, BNPT. This allows for the inclusion of their female centered prevention programs into government approaches to CT. However, structural change towards effective gender mainstreaming, especially in intervention efforts still needs to take place.

From the outset, both participants and their organisations play a central role in advocating for grassroots inclusion into Indonesia's CT apparatus. As described by participant one from the Asian Muslim Action Network (AMAN), she is a well-connected civil society consultant and advisor to Indonesia's policy makers and law enforcement agencies and to other sub regional and international bodies such as the UN. Our second participant holds the Assistant Director's position for the widely trusted Wahid Foundation/ Institute. This participant also holds a similar consultant and advisory role in the representation of her organization and interactions with government.

To understand the roles, activities and positions of participants of this study is crucial to understanding the inner workings of the civil society apparatus in Indonesia. In their attempts to advocate for the role and inclusion of women in P/CVE as well as gender mainstreaming in Indonesia's CT apparatus, the insights from these participants and insights from those leading the charge and advocating for change. Both participants and organisations clearly hold an immense amount of power in shaping this space. Their descriptions and opinions thus are important to dissect how to pursue and advocate for a whole society approach to CT.

<u>Peacebuilding and Preventing/ Countering Violent Extremism</u>

As emphasised by our participants, peacebuilding is the framework pursued by grassroots organisations in their P/CVE activities. As described by one participant, peacebuilding provides a comprehensive approach to P/CVE because instances of violent extremism

`

demonstrate similar causal roots to instances of conflict. Peacebuilding methods are borrowed and mirrored in cases of violent extremism at a grassroots level because it provides these organisations with the capacity to build trust and a longer lasting peace. This is as opposed to staunch securitized approaches that might install fear, distrust and panic in communities.

For example, peacebuilding in P/CVE in Indonesia focuses on building social cohesion and a capacity for communities to understand their differences. Additionally, peacebuilding aims to bring individuals together through tolerance to overcome radicalism and violent, divisive ideology. This participant then goes onto describe the importance of centralizing the role of women in peacebuilding efforts because "the role of women centralized in the community means that the community is functioning well and able to detect any symptoms that threaten their lives or divide their lives." As aligned with the literature, peacebuilding becomes a mechanism through which P/CVE can be pursued beyond securitized counter-terrorism methods and towards a whole society approach with women at the centre.

The activities of each organization and peace building methods of each organization have some similarities, some differences and highlight the breadth of peacebuilding methods used to P/CVE on a grassroots level. As described by the participant from AMAN, the organization focuses on prevention beyond counter-terrorism, tackling the conducive environments towards violent extremism. Gender equality and building strong families are at the core of AMAN's activities towards building peace. It is AMAN's belief that when empowered and equipped, women invest their entire of their lives and their families lives towards achieving peace and stability. Critical thinking programs and education are AMAN's main prevention tools. For example, the AMAN peace goes to school and peace goes to campus program use girl ambassadors and affiliated religious organisations to reinforce the concept of being Indonesian before being a Muslim. Such programs push young students, especially young women, to assess Indonesia's history with extremism and critically think about the manifestation of extremism.

Secondly, AMAN champions the mainstreaming of female perspectives in the Indonesian religious establishment as a means towards achieving peace. AMAN have partnered with the AMAN have partnered with the Indonesian Women Ulama Congress (KUPI) to run programs that guide women to reinterpret extreme interpretations of Islamic texts that affect their social, economic and personal wellbeing. AMAN believe that strengthening the leadership positions of female Ulama in the Indonesian religious establishment will challenge the mainstreaming of extremist religious views of women. This, in turn, will contribute to an ever-morphing empowerment of women overtime and promote peaceful and equal gender relations in Indonesia. For example, KUPI releases fatwa that steer clear of binaries such as halal or haram. Instead, these fatwas present counter-narratives and religious opinions on issues such as violence against women and preventing violent extremism through the inclusion of experiential and emotional religious dialogue. Additionally, reflective dialogue programs between female ulama and wives of terrorists to deconstruct radical ideologies, through providing these wives with the agency to identify extremist elements of their family nucleus. Respect and non-judgmental dialogue are at the heart of these programs and form a core part of building female capacity to deconstruct extremism and promote peace.

Similarly, the Wahid institute place peacebuilding at the heart of their programs and approaches to P/CVE. The Wahid Institute champion a gendered approach to peacebuilding, however, execute programs differently to AMAN. The Wahid Institute have organized their

`

purpose and activities into three pillars: economic empowerment, peacebuilding and community development mechanisms and women's empowerment. These pillars reflect themes emanating from the literature on women in P/CVE including the role of empowerment and education to build capacity for women to champion peace in their communities.

Programs in the Economic Empowerment pillar aim to build community economic resilience. These programs are centered around the economic empowerment of women in rural villages that reflects the intention of the National Action Plan on the Protection and Empowerment of Women and Children in Social Conflict where equal economic opportunity could be used as a prevention tool for future social conflict. The Wahid Foundation provide women with micro loans and equip women with skills in entrepreneurship. The goals of these economic initiatives are twofold: to increase equal female opportunity and independence and to provide women with the means to invest their skills, experiences and income into their families for overall wellbeing and better opportunities. Building capacity and resilience in the economic sphere is an integral part of the Wahid foundations peacebuilding activities.

The peacebuilding and community development pillar are used by the Wahid Institute to 'cultivate values' in vulnerable parts of the community. This mission is driven by two main concerns: how women are equipped to act and make decisions when faced with 'conflict' and how to prevent 'conflict'. Through programs such as supporting local women to lobby in public, developing early warning systems to identify radical, intolerant behavior and establishing a peace women's centre, the Wahid Institute promotes a grassroots movement capable of challenging long-standing social norms and structures. Additionally, other community development initiatives have a focus on building capacity of young people to think critically about online content. Most notably, the Wahid Institute build and promote interfaith groups at school and university campuses and work with the major social media companies such as Twitter and Facebook as policy development consultants, trusted partners and cyber army leaders to help identify and filter radical content.

The women's empowerment pillar develops grassroots capability for women to actively participate in communal decision-making and to develop peace narratives. The Peace Village initiative is the core of Wahid Foundation's women's empowerment and peacebuilding agenda. The Wahid Institute describes the Peace Village program encourages the role of women as agents of peace in preventing violence and developing social cohesion and resilience in the community. These peace villages are at the kampeong (village) level and work to prevent the presence of radical teachings in communities. The critical component of these working groups is the representation that makes up these groups. For example, a working group must be made up of representatives from the village government, religious leaders of all faiths and women from the community with the chair of the working group being a woman. The Peace Village program reflects key aspects of the literature on women's non-traditional roles in decision-making and leadership positions.

Evidently, approaches taken by AMAN and the Wahid Institute are leading best practice models in embedding peacebuilding from a gendered lens into a broader, whole of society approach to CT. At the heart of this intersectional approach to P/CVE is a clear capacity to strengthen and empower the various roles women play in Indonesian society and how these roles meaningfully manifest into key components of de-radicalisation and prevention of violence and extremism.

`

Gender Norms, Religion and Female Empowerment

The relationship between gender, social norms and extremism in Indonesia is highly complex to unpack but is a relationship that lays the groundwork for why mobilizing women at the grassroots is a crucial inclusion into Indonesia's whole of society CT approach. It is arguably why organisations such as AMAN and the Wahid Institute have such powerful, best practice models in the P/CVE space. This paper set out to answer one of two questions: to what extent can women in Indonesia be effective agents of change in challenges extremism if they are subjected to patriarchal social and religious gender norms? The answer to this question is not straightforward and is buried in a very contentious debate over how and whether these norm disparities when it comes to gender, exists. Whilst it would be beyond the aim of this paper to deconstruct these perspectives, this paper will focus on two main findings:

1. That gender can be a key indicator of growing or existing extremist behavior in Indonesia; and
2. Women who radicalise in Indonesia do so for a variety of reasons that extend from freedom and agency to victimization. Despite their reasons, women who radicalise in Indonesia do so with the intent of proving their worth and dedication to their male spouses, family members or community acquaintances. Their ability to rejuvenate their extremism into peacebuilding is dependent on their conviction.

In relation to the first main finding, the bottom line for both participants is that radical shifts in behavior that are usually gendered and towards women are key indicators of extremism. To better dissect, challenge and understand the gendered implications of these behaviors becomes crucial to the work of these grassroots organisations. For example, the Wahid Foundation, in partnership with UN Women conducted a *National Survey Report of the Potential of Socio-Religious Tolerance among Muslim Women in Indonesia* in 2017 to identify the capacity of Indonesian women to be core pioneers of peacebuilding initiatives in their communities.[45] The survey identified that women have the capacity to promote tolerance in their communities.[46] It found that women were less intolerant and more unwilling to radicalise then men.[47] However, the survey also found that gender mainstreaming and women's empowerment were approaches needed to enhance this capacity.[48] The survey found that there is still a low degree of autonomy for women to make decisions about their own lives than men and a low number of women who believe in pro-gender justice.[49] Therefore, breaking down more conservative socio-religious views on women is clearly an important mission to build the capacity of women to build peace at a grassroots level.

The second main finding reflects a very interesting dichotomy that exists in Indonesia. Female radicals can see themselves as agents of feminism through their extremism where others radicalise as an extension of their husbands/family's subjugation and manipulation. Whilst this does not reflect all experiences of females in Indonesia, these are two stark contrasting experiences that were discussed by the participants. To understand this dichotomy

[45] Wahid Foundation, 2017. National Survey Report of the Potential of Socio-Religious Tolerance among Muslim Women in Indonesia.

[46] Ibid.

[47] Ibid.

[48] Ibid.

[49] Ibid.

`

is to understand the extent to which women who adopt extremism can become women who promote peace in their societies. This can be broken down into two typologies:

1. the agent of feminism jihadi who is less likely to turn away from extremism because of a stronger conviction in their beliefs (with some exceptions to returnees who may be turned off by their experiences as foreign fighters); and
2. the mother, wife or daughter who is more likely to have the capacity to identify extremism because they came into their situation not by choice but through force, patriarchal burden and manipulation.

At the core of the 'agent of feminism' jihadi typology is the conviction that extremism and violent extremist behavior is a way woman can 'prove' themselves. As highlighted by the participant from AMAN, women in this typology are usually 'reeled' in to extremist beliefs through a 'reverse feminism' agenda championed by groups like ISIS in recruitment phases. Such ideology aims to shape relatively extreme restrictions on women's freedom to ways in which women can prove their ultimate devotion and gain recognition and stature from this devotion. The extent to which conviction in achieving this 'recognition' is strong, will determine how women within this typology will be receptive to P/CVE strategies. For example, the AMAN participant discussed the different results achieved when intervening into the extremism of foreign fighter deportees in comparison to foreign fighter returnees. It was found that foreign fighter deportees were more inclined to support extremism and violence in Indonesia because they had not physically experienced life under the Caliphate during ISIS' existence. Whereas, intervention efforts by AMAN were more receptive amongst returnees because their experiences of perpetrating violent extremism did not match up to their expectations and goals of achieving glory in recognition of their commitment.

The second typology encapsulates the presence of embedded patriarchal norms in Indonesia. As specified by both participants, socio-religious patriarchal norms are widespread across rural communities in Indonesia. These are areas with little social and economic opportunity for women and where family is the core of the community and the bedrock of religious devotion. As described by the Wahid participant, women in these communities are scared to disobey their husbands and view male elements of the family as a direct lineage to God. For example, the Wahid participant sites her experiences from grassroots work in Madura, East Java. The way men view women in this community comes down to the religious tradition: 'Perempuan adalah contowinki'- women in the kitchen, bed and well. It is here that women serve basic domestic functions and generally need to ask men for permission in their daily lives. As an extension of these patriarchal conditions, women will inherently adopt the views and convictions of their husbands by virtue of this dynamic, which could lead them down pathways of extremism. However, the participant from AMAN Indonesia suggests that intervention into the lives of these women through reverse dialogue, storytelling, economic empowerment initiatives and critical thinking programs is effective in engaging these women to promote peace. It is effective because women are more receptive to challenging beliefs and circumstances that are not substantiated by their own personal choices and convictions. Therefore, through the right tools of empowerment and engagement, women do have the agency and the will to be effective agents of promoting peace.

Whilst this will not be true for all women in these situations across Indonesia, it is clear there is an opportunity here for grassroots organisations to make their impact in the P/CVE space. There may be limitations with regards to those in the 'agents of feminism' typology. However, the discussion with the participants demonstrated that whilst religious patriarchy

`

does exist, it does not stop women from becoming agents of change in the P/CVE space in Indonesia.

Civil Society-Government Relations, Gender Mainstreaming and Structural Change

A key goal of this paper is to identify the role of civil society in contributing to Indonesia's whole of society/ soft approach to CT. More specifically, this paper wanted to explore the nature of this relationship and whether the high-level inclusion of this gendered lens was genuine. As this paper will uncover and contrary to the literature review, civil society in Indonesia is well engaged by and genuinely connected to government consultation, decision-making and designing of programs in the P/CVE space. Although, when it comes to making key structural changes to decision-making institutions in this space, this is where Indonesia is falling short of the mark. If there are no equal opportunities for women to be designing policy, managing programs and making approvals in the bureaucracy, the intricacies of gendered experiences in this space continue to be overlooked and not incorporated whole heartedly.

Both participants identified that their organisations genuine working relationships with government can be found in prevention activities. For example, both organisations played strong consultation roles in designing prevention-led policy initiatives in Indonesia. These include the: National Action Plan on the Protection and Empowerment of Women and Children in Social Conflict and the new National Action Plan on Countering Violent Extremism. Furthermore, both organisations play a key operational and facilitation role within Indonesia's CT agency, BNPT. Both participants specify how their organisations work directly with BNPT agents to administer prevention programs focused on building capacity for peace amongst women at a grassroots level across 32 communities in Indonesia. These programs range from critical thinking programs to economic empowerment and leadership programs. These working relationships that extend beyond just basic consultation roles demonstrates the growing strength of Indonesia's whole of society approach and the seriousness taken by Indonesian decision-makers on incorporating gendered experiences into CT approaches.

However, it is also noted that female representation in the 'intervention' phase of CT policy and the activities of organisations such as BNPT is lacking. According to the participant from AMAN, without genuine attempts to gender mainstream in the CT operational space, the intricacies of the impacts of terrorism on women will continue to go unnoticed. Both participants pointed to the lackluster attempts of those in the CT space in Indonesia to incorporate the requirements of Indonesian gender mainstreaming laws. These laws require gender mainstreaming efforts (incorporation of women at all levels of decision-making and participation) to be applied in the realization of all policy. AMAN generated four gender sensitive indicators that set the standard for how gender mainstreaming can be effectively implemented in Indonesia. These are: inclusion, participation, access and leadership. Despite the existence of these laws and the many attempts for these organisations to consult on the inclusion of the indicators into CT agencies, there are still improvements that need to be made to achieve effective gender mainstreaming. For example, the willingness of the BNPT to appoint female leaders, project managers and key operational staff is a structural bias the agency needs to overcome. The AMAN participant highlights that these structural biases against women have a myriad of impacts. AMAN used the example of how female jihadi prisoners still do not have access to adequate feminine hygiene products or are not supported adequately during pregnancy terms. An inclusion of female leadership and perspective in

`

these types of operational/intervention type CT spaces could acknowledge the importance of access to basic levels of access to products and support for these women.

Overall, it is clear that the participants represent some of the most innovative and effective approaches to strengthening a whole of society approach to CT. Peacebuilding to achieve a practical application of a whole of society approach, deconstructing and balancing the effects of patriarchal norms and growing female agency in Indonesia and strong, working relationships between civil society and government all make for an ever-morphing best practice approach to P/CVE. Where there are key strengths and key areas of growth and development, the passion and dedication to promoting and engaging women in P/CVE in Indonesia demonstrates the importance of these grassroots, gendered approaches as a key piece of the overall CT puzzle.

5. Conclusion: Findings and Recommendations

Overall, this paper endeavored to deconstruct and subsequently paint a picture of grassroots, female focused P/CVE efforts in Indonesia. In conducting the literature review and the field study, this paper noticed issues in deconstructing the complex relationship between women and social norms whilst wanting to understand how grassroots based initiatives are implemented at a decision-making level in the CT space. Overall, this paper found that:

- Women have the capacity to contribute to P/CVE and subsequently CT in a variety of ways when empowered through various means;
- Patriarchal norms exist in Indonesia, but this does not stop women from being able to challenge behaviors that subdue them or could lead to violence; and
- Civil society and government have strong, genuine working relationships in some areas but need overall structural adjustments to achieve well thought out decision-making in the CT space.

From these findings. some recommendations can be made:

1. **Indonesian grassroots organisations:** should consolidate their vision, activities, goals and future planning to create a best-practice model for women in P/CVE.
2. **Indonesian grassroots organisations:** should further their work with government to pursue higher level, structural change to implement gender-mainstreaming as a widespread norm in the CT space in Indonesia.
3. **The CT apparatus in Indonesia:** should continue to engage grassroots organisations in CT prevention but commit to implementing gender sensitive indicators, especially within the BNPT to improve gender-mainstreaming outcomes.
4. **The CT apparatus in Indonesia:** commit to publishing and implementing the new National Action Plan on Countering Violent Extremism so Indonesia can begin to lead the world in developing strong, inclusive and genuine whole of society approach to CT.
5. **Sub regional and regional institutions:** should engage grassroots organisations and Indonesian CT officials in the training and development of women, peace and security national action plans, the mobilisation and building of working relationships between government and civil society at the grassroots level and understanding gender dynamics and their importance place in P/CVE and how these can be implemented in collaborative CT efforts amongst states.

`

References

Majoran, 2015. Mothers & Wives: Women's Potential Role in Countering Violent Extremism. Quilliam Foundation, https://www.quilliaminternational.com/mothers-wives-womens-potential-role-in-countering-violent-extremism/.

Australian National Committee for UN Women, 2014. Women, Peace & Security: an introductory manual, s.l.: Australian National Committee for UN Women.

Barnes, 2017. Countering violent extremism: contemporary research and its challenges. In: L. E. Sayed & J. Barnes, eds. Contemporary P/CVE Research and Practice. s.l.:Hedayah and Edith Cowan University, pp. 7-18.

Centre for Gender and Peacebuilding, 2015. Charting a New Course: Thought for Action Kit. Women Preventing Violent Extremism. pp. 30. https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/files/Women-Preventing-Violent-Extremism-Charting-New-Course.pdf.

Aolian,, 2015. Jihad, counter-terrorism and mothers. Just Security. Available at: https:// www.justsecurity.org/20407/jihad-counter-terrorism-mothers/.

Hardy, Keiran, 2018. Comparing Theories of Radicalisation with Countering Violent Extremism Policy. Journal for Deradicalization, Issue 15, pp. 76-100.

True, Eddyono, 2017. Preventing Violent Extremism: Gender Perspectives and Women's Roles. Monash University. Available at: https://arts.monash.edu/__data/assets/pdf_file/0011/1779068/Policy-brief-PVE-2017.pdf.

Couture, 2014. A Gendered Approach to Countering Violent Extremism: Lessons Learned from Women in Peacebuilding and Conflict Prevention Applied Successfully In Bangladesh and Morocco pp. 2. Available at: https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/Women-CVE-Formatted-72914-Couture-FINAL2.pdf.

Brown, 2013. Gender and counter-radicalization, women and emerging counterterrorism measures. In: Margaret L. Satterthwaite and Jayne Huckerby eds. (2013) Gender, National Security and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives. Routledge. pp. 36–59.

Taskarina, 2019. Perempuan Dan Terorisme: Kisah perempuan dalam Kejahatan Terorisme. Elex Media Komputindo.

Wulan, 2018. Enhancing the Role of Women in Indonesia to Counter Terrorism. *Alumni Perpectives*. pp. 1-13.

Wahid Foundation, 2017. National Survey Report of the Potential of Socio-Religious Tolerance among Muslim Women in Indonesia.

Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, 2019. Understanding the Role of Gender in Preventing and Countering Violent Extremism and Radicalization That Lead

`

to Terrorism: Good Practices for Law Enforcement. Vienna: the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe.

Davies, Eddyono, 2019. Women's Roles in CVE. In: 1st ed.: Oxford University Press.

d'Estaing, 2017. Engaging women in countering violent extremism: avoiding instrumentalisation and furthering agency. Gender & Development, 25, no. 1. pp. 103-118.

United Nations Office of Counter-Terrorism, 2019. Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism. [Online] Available at: https://www.un.org/counterterrorism/ctitf/en/plan-action-prevent-violent-extremism [Accessed 8 September 2019]

UN Women, 2017. Empowered Women, Peaceful Communities. United Nations. Available at: https://www2.unwomen.org//media/field%20office%20eseasia/docs/publications/2019/08/ap-pve-unw19290_brochure_002_web-compressed.pdf?la=en&vs=4035.

Emily, 2018. Do Mothers Know Best? How Assumptions Harm CVE. Tony Blair Institute of Global Change.